



Division of Transportation

Paula J. Trigg, P.E.
Director of Transportation/County Engineer

600 W. Winchester Road
Libertyville, Illinois 60048-1381
Phone 847-362-3950
Fax 847-984-5888

Memo

To: Paula J. Trigg

From: Benjamin Russo

Subj: Justification of Bid – 7/19/16 Letting

File: Robert McClory Bike Path
Abutment Repairs

Sect: 16-00173-14-BR

Date: 7/19/2016

<input type="checkbox"/> For Your Info/Files	<input type="checkbox"/> Review and Comment	<input type="checkbox"/> Please Reply for my Signature	<input type="checkbox"/> Please Report on Current Status
<input type="checkbox"/> Per Your Request	<input type="checkbox"/> Investigate and Report	<input type="checkbox"/> Please Call/See Me	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> For Your Approval and Signature
<input type="checkbox"/> Please Process	<input type="checkbox"/> Note and Return	OK'd by <u>Paula Trigg</u>	Date <u>July 26, 2016</u>

Paula,

All five of the bids received for the Robert McClory Bike Path Abutment Repairs project exceeded the Engineer's Estimate of \$376,349.50. The low bid was over the estimate by \$228,153.50.

This type of improvement is an uncommon County undertaking; therefore, no significant history of bid prices exists for many of the pay items included. Consequently, unit prices for this project were developed by the structural design consultant, and were based on bid prices of similar improvements received for Illinois Tollway projects that the firm has worked on.

Analysis of the bid tabulation shows the bulk of the difference was contained within three particular items which vary significantly compared to the engineer's estimate. The low bidder's unit cost for *Architectural Finish for Concrete Surfaces* came in about 1.3 times higher than estimated. Unit costs for *Structural Repair of Concrete (Depth ≤ 5")* and *Structural Repair of Concrete (Depth > 5")* came in approximately 1.8 times and 3.7 times higher than estimated, respectively.

The estimated unit cost for the architectural finish was in line with unit prices bid on the lone previous County project in which the technique was used. The higher cost for the structural repair items could be due to an increase in the effort required to prepare the abutment face for the architectural finish, which might not have been adequately reflected in the estimated unit prices.

The proposed architectural finish, consisting of the application of a thin concrete overlay after structural repairs were completed and stamped with a stone pattern, was a late addition to the project scope. Originally, deteriorated concrete was proposed to be removed to varying depths and restored to a generally smooth finish compared with surrounding areas of the abutment face. Adding architectural stamping resulted in additional work necessary to ensure the entire face of each abutment was flat enough to produce an aesthetically pleasing stamp pattern.

As there were five bidders for this project, it is not anticipated that re-letting this project would result in a lower bid prices. Based on the above analysis I recommend that the County award the contract to the low bidder, Acura, Inc., at the bid price of \$604,503.00.

Approved by:



Michael G. Zemaitis P.E.
Engineer of Design



Benjamin A. Russo, P.E.
Project Engineer